

**CITY OF SAN ANTONIO  
HUMAN RESOURCES DEPARTMENT  
Interdepartmental Correspondence**

**TO:** Erik Walsh, City Manager

**FROM:** Renee Frieda, Interim Director, Human Resources Department

**COPIES:** Audit and Accountability Committee; Ben Gorzell, Jr., CPA, Chief Financial Officer; Kevin Barthold, City Auditor; Troy Elliott, CPA, Deputy Chief Financial Officer

**SUBJECT:** Consideration of Completed High Profile Solicitation

**DATE:** August 20, 2021

The following high-profile project has completed the solicitation process. This item is presented to the Audit and Accountability committee for review prior to the full City Council for consideration.

**Voluntary Vision Insurance** – The Human Resources Department solicited proposals from experienced vision insurance firms to administer eligibility and enrollment for a fully-insured vision care plan available to full time civilian employees as well as to retirees that meets or exceeds current benefit levels. The City’s Employee Benefits program provides voluntary vision insurance to approximately 7,000 full-time civilian employees and 1,600 retired employees. The City will provide eligibility data to the vendor for retirees; however, billing and collection will be handled directly by the vendor. Civilian employees and retirees are responsible for the full cost of the premiums. Premiums for civilian employees are deducted from 24 bi-weekly paychecks on a pre-tax basis. Retirees will be billed on a monthly basis for coverage.

|                         |   |
|-------------------------|---|
| Solicitation Type:      | Request for Proposals   |
| Contract Value:         | \$3.1 Million   |
| Term of Contract:       | 3 years with 2, 1-year renewal options  |
| Number of Respondents:  | 6   |
| Contract to be Awarded: | 1   |
| Proposed Council Date:  | September 2, 2021   |
| Evaluation Criteria:    | Experience, Background, Qualifications: 25 Points<br>Proposed Plan: 40 Points<br>Price: 20 Points<br>Local Preference Program: 10 Points<br>Veteran-Owned Small Business Preference Program: 5 Points   |
| SBEDA Program:          | Waived  |
| Voting Members:         | Renee Frieda, Interim Director, Human Resources Department<br>Pat Atkins, Benefits Policy Administrator, Human Resources Department<br>Jim Thomas, Employee Benefits Administrator, Human Resources Department<br>Manny Espino, Employee Benefits Manager, Human Resources Department |

**Initial Score Matrix**

| Voluntary Vision Insurance<br>(21-049, 6100013819)<br><br>Score Summary<br>INITIAL EVALUATION<br>June 22, 2021 | Maximum Points | Vendor A     | Vendor B     | Vendor C     | Vendor D     | Vendor E     | Vendor F     |
|--|----------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|
| A - Experience, Background, Qualifications   | 25             | 21.75        | 22.75        | 21.50        | 17.50        | 17.50        | 14.50        |
| B - Proposed Plan  | 40             | 35.50        | 34.75        | 32.25        | 27.00        | 26.75        | 22.25        |
| A - B Sub-Total  | 65             | 57.25        | 57.50        | 53.75        | 44.50        | 44.25        | 36.75        |
| C - Price  | 20             | 13.69        | 20.00        | 16.12        | 16.20        | 15.56        | 15.21        |
| D - LPP  | 10             | 10.00        | 0.00         | 0.00         | 0.00         | 0.00         | 0.00         |
| E - VOSBPP   | 5              | 0.00         | 0.00         | 0.00         | 0.00         | 0.00         | 0.00         |
| <b>TOTAL SCORE</b>   | <b>100</b>     | <b>80.94</b> | <b>77.50</b> | <b>69.87</b> | <b>60.70</b> | <b>59.81</b> | <b>51.96</b> |
| <b>RANK BASED ON TOTAL SCORE</b>   |                | <b>1</b>     | <b>2</b>     | <b>3</b>     | <b>4</b>     | <b>5</b>     | <b>6</b>     |

Two firms were shortlisted for interviews. Final scoring was conducted upon completion of interviews.

**Final Score Matrix**

| Voluntary Vision Insurance<br>(21-049, 6100013819)<br><br>Score Summary<br>FINAL EVALUATION<br>July 1, 2021 | Maximum Points | Vendor A     | Vendor B     |
|---|----------------|--------------|--------------|
| A - Experience, Background, Qualifications  | 25             | 22.00        | 22.75        |
| B - Proposed Plan   | 40             | 32.25        | 37.00        |
| A - B Sub-Total   | 65             | 54.25        | 59.75        |
| C - Price   | 20             | 13.69        | 20.00        |
| D - LPP   | 10             | 10.00        | 0.00         |
| E - VOSBPP  | 5              | 0.00         | 0.00         |
| <b>TOTAL SCORE</b>  | <b>100</b>     | <b>77.94</b> | <b>79.75</b> |
| <b>RANK BASED ON TOTAL SCORE</b>  |                | <b>2</b>     | <b>1</b>     |

Due diligence conducted for the respondents to the above solicitation included a search of federal and state debarment lists, prohibited political contributions, conflicts of interest, delinquent City/County taxes, outstanding payments to the City, payment of state franchise fees as well as a search of the internet for pertinent business information. No material findings were noted that would prevent the City from awarding to the selected vendors.

Staff recommends committee approval to proceed with scheduling this item for full City Council consideration.